

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JANUARY 26, 2023
HYBRID HEARING**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

Chairperson Tim Hutter called the meeting to order at 1:07 p.m. Chairperson Tim Hutter adjourned the meeting at 2:20 p.m.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING:

Chairperson Tim Hutter – present
Vice-Chairperson Kristi Byers – present
2nd Vice-Chairperson Michael Taylor – absent
Boardmember Ann Woods – present
Boardmember Bruce Abrams – present
Boardmember Carla Farley – absent
Boardmember Courtney Ann Coyle – present
Boardmember David McCullough – present
Boardmember Dr. Li-Rong Lilly Cheng – present
Boardmember Mathew Winter – absent

City Staff

Jeanne MacKinnon, Deputy City Attorney – present
Bernie Turgeon, Planning Department - present
Renee Mezo, Development Services Department – present
Elizabeth Shearer-Nguyen, Development Services Department – present
Suzanne Segur, Development Services Department – present
Shannon Anthony, Development Services Department – present
Alvin Lin, Development Services Department – present
Andrew Wood, Development Services Department – present
Megan Walker, Development Services Department – present
Caroline Garcia, Legislative Recorder – present

Note: All decision makers attended meeting in person. Staff and members of the public attended both in person and virtually

ANNOUNCEMENTS/PUBLIC COMMENT

Public comment received from Andrea Schlageter, member of the Ocean Beach task force, introducing herself and looking forward to speaking to the board in the future regarding the design of the pier.

BOARDMEMBERS COMMENT

None

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

None

EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

Chair Hutter and Boardmember Woods were unable to do a site visit for item 1.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR BYERS TO INVOKE THE WAIVE THE SITE VISIT REQUIREMENT PURSUANT TO FACTOR 2 FOR CHAIR HUTTER AND BOARDMEMBERS WOODS FOR ITEM 1 AND ITS AVAILABILITY OF ACCESS TO THE SITE THAT ITS LIMITED IN THE HISTORICAL ELEMENTS ARE SUFFICIENTLY DOCUMENTED OR DEMONSTRABLE TO THE BOARD THROUGH THE USE OF GRAPHIC OR OTHER VISUAL AIDS PRESENTED OR PRIOR TO THE MEETING. Seconded by Boardmember McCullough. The motion passed by a vote of 5-0-2 with Boardmembers Cheng, Abrams, Byers, McCullough, Coyle, voting yea, with Chair Hutter and Boardmember Woods recusing with Boardmembers Farley, Taylor, and Winter absent

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FOR NOVEMBER 17, 2022

No Discussion

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BYERS TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR NOVEMBER 17, 2022. Seconded by Boardmember Woods. The motion passed by a vote of 5-0-2 with Boardmembers McCullough, Byers, Hutter, Woods, and Abrams voting yea, with Boardmember Cheng and Coyle recusing, with Boardmembers Farley, Taylor, and Winter absent.

STAFF REPORT

Renee Mezo, Assistant Deputy Director of the Development Services Department welcomed everyone back and informed the Board that this new location (San Diego City College 1046 16th Street, San Diego, CA 92101-Mathematics & Social Sciences Building) will be the location that we will be having 2023 calendar year monthly Historical Resources Board (HRB) meetings. Also, she reminded the board that come February 2023 all boardmembers must be present in the HRB meetings. The boardmembers have a choice to use Just Cause and use this two times a year per boardmember if needed. More information will come via the City Attorney.

Shannon Anthony, Senior Planner of the Development Services Department reported out for 2022 the City received a total of 145 Mills Act applications and processed 140 agreements which were recorded at the end of last year. 2023 Mills Acts applications are currently being accepted during the open application period of January 1st and will end on March 31st. To be eligible to apply the property must be historically designated on the local register by December 31st of the prior year. New in 2023, applications are now accepted digitally through our online Accela portal.

Suzanne Segur, Senior Planner of the Development Services Department reported that two site development permits for historical resources were approved unanimously by the Planning Commission in December and those are for the Andrew Cassidy Home, HRB #283 currently located at 1620 Union Street and the LGBTQ Community/ Albert Bell Building, HRB #1453 located 3780 Fifth Avenue. Currently under construction is the site development permit for the Pacific Telephone and Telegraph Company Garage, HRB #1355 located at 660 10th Avenue. The other project is the Balboa Park Botanical Building restoration which will restore the building to its original 1915 appearance with some small modifications. The project is scheduled to be completed in the spring of 2024.

Bernie Turgeon, Senior Planner of the Planning Department reported a few announcements; the historic resource component of the Mira Mesa Community Plan update was approved as part of the new community plan by City Council in December. Lastly, the Bungalow Courts and Apartment Courts Historic Context Statement is now posted to the Planning Department’s website along with Deputy Director Kelly Stanco’s cover memo.

REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE CONTINUED AND/OR WITHDRAWN

None

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Item 3 – Carl and Ethel Mae Sharp House located at 3425 Xenophon Street was pulled from the Consent Agenda and was heard as the first discussion item. Item 6 – Michael and Helen Donnelly House located at 4190 Utah Street was pulled from the Consent Agenda and was heard as the second discussion item.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR HUTTER TO HEAR ITEMS 3 AND 6 IN THAT ORDER. Seconded by Boardmember Coyle. The motion passed by a vote of 7-0-0 with Boardmembers Coyle, McCullough, Byers, Hutter, Woods, Abrams, and Cheng voting yea, with Boardmembers Farley, Taylor, and Winter absent.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

ITEM-1

HERBERT YORK/ HERBERT PALMER HOUSE

City Council District: 1

Plan Area: La Jolla

Staff: Suzanne Segur

No public testimony in support of the designation.

No public testimony in opposition of the designation.

No speaker slips in favor received on this item.

No speaker slips received in opposition on this item.

BOARD ACTION:

CONSENT MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WOODS TO DESIGNATE THE HERBERT YORK/ HERBERT PALMER HOUSE/CASA DE LOS AMIGOS LOCATED AT 6110 CAMINO DEL LA COSTA AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE UNDER HRB CRITERION A WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1924; UNDER CRITERION B WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1964-1970, 1972-1979 AND 1983-2009; AND UNDER CRITERION C AND D WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1924. THE DESIGNATION INCLUDES THE STONE WALL ON THE COASTAL BLUFF AND STUCCO SITE WALL ALONG CAMINO DE LA COSTA.

Seconded by Boardmember Coyle. The motion passed by a vote of 7-0-0 with Boardmembers Coyle, McCullough, Byers, Hutter, Woods, Abrams, and Cheng voting yea, with Boardmembers Farley, Taylor, and Winter absent.

ITEM-2 EDWARD AND EMMA NEWMAN BUILDING

City Council District: 3

Plan Area: North Park

Staff: Suzanne Segur

No public testimony in support of the designation.

No public testimony in opposition of the designation.

Speaker slips in favor received on this item from David Marshall.

No speaker slips received in opposition on this item.

BOARD ACTION:

CONSENT MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WOODS APPROVING STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE THE EDWARD AND EMMA NEWMAN BUILDING LOCATED AT 2906-2912 UNIVERSITY AVENUE AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE UNDER HRB CRITERION A WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1929-1932 AND UNDER HRB CRITERION C WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1929. Seconded by Boardmember Coyle. The motion passed by a vote of 7-0-0 with Boardmembers Coyle, McCullough, Byers, Hutter, Woods, Abrams, and Cheng voting yea, with Boardmembers Farley, Taylor, and Winter absent.

ITEM-3 CARL AND ETHEL MAE SHARP HOUSE

City Council District: 2

Plan Area: Peninsula

Staff: Shannon Anthony

No public testimony in support of the designation.

No public testimony received in opposition of the designation.

No speaker slips in favor received on this item.

No speaker slips received in opposition on this item.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE APPROVING STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO THE DESIGNATE THE CARL AND ETHEL MAE SHARP HOUSE LOCATED AT 3425 XENOPHON STREET AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1937 UNDER HRB CRITERION C. THE DESIGNATION EXCLUDES THE 1967 AND 2019 REAR ADDITIONS BUILT OUTSIDE THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. Seconded by Boardmember Cheng. The motion passed by a vote of 7-0-0 with Boardmembers Coyle, McCullough, Byers, Hutter, Woods, Abrams, and Cheng voting yea, with Boardmembers Farley, Taylor, and Winter absent.

Note: This item was heard as the first discussion item.

ITEM-4 ERBY AND MABEL DEPUTY HOUSE

City Council District: 9

Plan Area: College Area

Staff: Alvin Lin

No public testimony in support of the designation.

No public testimony in opposition of the designation.

No speaker slips in favor received on this item.

No speaker slips received in opposition on this item.

BOARD ACTION:

CONSENT MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WOODS APPROVING STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE THE ERBY AND MABEL DEPUTY HOUSE LOCATED AT 4603 56TH AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1936 UNDER HRB CRITERION C. THE DESIGNATION INCLUDES THE GARAGE, THE BRICK SITE WALL, AND THE BRICK BARBEQUE. Seconded by Boardmember Coyle. The motion passed by a vote of 7-0-0 with Boardmembers Coyle, McCullough, Byers, Hutter, Woods, Abrams, and Cheng voting yea, with Boardmembers Farley, Taylor, and Winter absent.

ITEM-5

CARL AND ETHEL MAE SHARP SPEC HOUSE #1

City Council District: 9

Plan Area: Kensington Talmadge

Staff: Megan Walker

No public testimony in support of the designation

No public testimony in opposition of the designation.

Speaker slips in favor received on this item from Pamela Molohon, Ron May, and Jessie Gross.

No speaker slips received in opposition on this item.

BOARD ACTION:

CONSENT MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WOODS APPROVING STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE THE CARL AND ETHEL MAE SHARP SPEC HOUSE #1 LOCATED AT 4971 KENSINGTON DRIVE AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1929 UNDER HRB CRITERION C. THE DESIGNATION EXCLUDES THE 2010 REAR MASTER BEDROOM ADDITION CONSTRUCTED OUTSIDE THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. Seconded by Boardmember Coyle. The motion passed by a vote of 7-0-0 with Boardmembers Coyle, McCullough, Byers, Hutter, Woods, Abrams, and Cheng voting yea, with Boardmembers Farley, Taylor, and Winter absent.

ITEM-6

MICHAEL AND HELEN DONNELLY HOUSE

City Council District: 3

Plan Area: North Park

Staff: Suzanne Segur

No public testimony in support of the designation.

No public testimony in opposition of the designation.

Speaker slip in favor received on this item from Wendy Tinsley Becker.

No speaker slips received in opposition on this item.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE APPROVING STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO DESIGNATE THE MICHAEL AND HELEN DONNELLY HOUSE LOCATED AT 4190 UTAH STREET AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1931 UNDER HRB CRITERION C. THE DESIGNATION EXCLUDES THE 2022 ACCESSORY DWELLING UNIT (ADU) CONSTRUCTED OUTSIDE OF THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. Seconded by Boardmember Cheng. The motion passed by a vote of 7-0-0 with Boardmembers Coyle, McCullough, Byers, Hutter, Woods, Abrams, and Cheng voting yea, with Boardmembers Farley, Taylor, and Winter absent.

Note: This item was heard as the second discussion item.

ITEM-7

STANDARDIZED REPORT OF THE CITY BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS 2022

Staff: Renee Mezo

No public testimony in support of the designation.

No public testimony in opposition of the designation.

No speaker slips in favor received on this item.

No speaker slips received in opposition on this item.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WOODS TO APPROVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE THE 2022 STANDARDIZED REPORT OF THE CITY BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS. Seconded by Boardmember Coyle. The motion passed by a vote of 7-0-0 with Boardmembers Coyle, McCullough, Byers, Hutter, Woods, Abrams, and Cheng voting yea, with Boardmembers Farley, Taylor, and Winter absent.